

**Corrected**

**In the United States Court of Federal Claims**  
**OFFICE OF SPECIAL MASTERS**  
**No. 20-1785V**

DONNA SMITH,

Petitioner,

v.

SECRETARY OF HEALTH AND  
HUMAN SERVICES,

Respondent.

Chief Special Master Corcoran

Filed: August 10, 2023

*Ronald Craig Homer, Conway, Homer, P.C., Boston, MA, for Petitioner.*

*Austin Joel Egan, U.S. Department of Justice, Washington, DC, for Respondent.*

**DECISION ON JOINT STIPULATION<sup>1</sup>**

On December 7, 2020, Donna Smith filed a petition for compensation under the National Vaccine Injury Compensation Program, 42 U.S.C. §300aa-10, *et seq.*<sup>2</sup> (the “Vaccine Act”). Petitioner alleges that she suffered a shoulder injury related to vaccine administration (“SIRVA”) as a result of an influenza vaccination she received on November 26, 2019. Petition at 1; Stipulation, filed at August 8, 2023, ¶¶ 2, 4. Petitioner further alleges that she has suffered the residual effects of her SIRVA injury for more than six months. Stipulation at ¶ 4. “Respondent denies that “Petitioner suffered from left shoulder injury as a result of the flu vaccine, and denies that the flu vaccine caused her any other injury or her current condition.” Stipulation at ¶ 6.

Nevertheless, on August 8, 2023, the parties filed the attached joint stipulation, stating that a decision should be entered awarding compensation. I find the stipulation reasonable and adopt it as my decision awarding damages, on the terms set forth therein.

---

<sup>1</sup> Because this Decision contains a reasoned explanation for the action taken in this case, it must be made publicly accessible and will be posted on the United States Court of Federal Claims' website, and/or at <https://www.govinfo.gov/app/collection/uscourts/national/cofc>, in accordance with the E-Government Act of 2002. 44 U.S.C. § 3501 note (2018) (Federal Management and Promotion of Electronic Government Services). **This means the Decision will be available to anyone with access to the internet.** In accordance with Vaccine Rule 18(b), Petitioner has 14 days to identify and move to redact medical or other information, the disclosure of which would constitute an unwarranted invasion of privacy. If, upon review, I agree that the identified material fits within this definition, I will redact such material from public access.

<sup>2</sup> National Childhood Vaccine Injury Act of 1986, Pub. L. No. 99-660, 100 Stat. 3755. Hereinafter, for ease of citation, all section references to the Vaccine Act will be to the pertinent subparagraph of 42 U.S.C. § 300aa (2018).

Pursuant to the terms stated in the attached Stipulation, I **award** the following compensation:

- **A lump sum of \$95,000.00 in the form of a check payable to Petitioner.** Stipulation at ¶ 8(A).
- **A lump sum of \$485.22 in the form of a check payable jointly to Petitioner and the New York State Department of Health,<sup>3</sup> New York State Department of Health, P.O. Box 415874, Boston, MA 02241-5874, Case ID 198658, representing reimbursement of a Medicaid lien for services rendered to Petitioner.** Stipulation at ¶ 8(B).
- These amounts represent compensation for all items of damages that would be available under Section 15(a).

I approve the requested amount for Petitioner's compensation. In the absence of a motion for review filed pursuant to RCFC Appendix B, the Clerk of Court is directed to enter judgment in accordance with this decision.<sup>4</sup>

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

**s/Brian H. Corcoran**

Brian H. Corcoran  
Chief Special Master

---

<sup>3</sup> After the Stipulation was filed, Petitioner confirmed that the check to satisfy Petitioner's Medicaid lien should be payable jointly to Petitioner and the New York Department of Health, rather than the New York State Treasurer as stated in the Stipulation. Petitioner requested that this Decision reflect the corrected payee and Respondent's counsel did not object to the change.

<sup>4</sup> Pursuant to Vaccine Rule 11(a), entry of judgment can be expedited by the parties' joint filing of notice renouncing the right to seek review.

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF FEDERAL CLAIMS  
OFFICE OF SPECIAL MASTERS**

DONNA SMITH,

Petitioner,

V.

SECRETARY OF HEALTH AND HUMAN  
SERVICES,

Respondent.

No. 20-1785V  
Chief Special Master Corcoran  
ECF

## STIPULATION

The parties hereby stipulate to the following matters:

1. Donna Smith (“petitioner”) filed a petition for vaccine compensation under the National Vaccine Injury Compensation Program, 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-10 to -34 (the “Vaccine Program”). The petition seeks compensation for injuries allegedly related to petitioner’s receipt of the influenza (“flu”) vaccine, which is contained in the Vaccine Injury Table (the “Table”), 42 C.F.R. § 100.3(a).

2. Petitioner received the flu vaccine on or about November 26, 2019.

3. The vaccine was administered in the United States.

4. Petitioner alleges that she suffered a left shoulder injury related to vaccine administration (“SIRVA”) as a result of receiving the flu vaccine. Petitioner further alleges that she experienced the residual effects of this injury for more than six months.

5. Petitioner represents that there has been no prior award or settlement of a civil action for damages as a result of her alleged condition.

6. Respondent denies that petitioner suffered from left shoulder injury as a result of the flu vaccine, and denies that the flu vaccine caused her any other injury or her current condition.

7. Maintaining their above-stated positions, the parties nevertheless now agree that the issues between them shall be settled and that a decision should be entered awarding the compensation described in paragraph 8 of this Stipulation.

8. As soon as practicable after an entry of judgment reflecting a decision consistent with the terms of this Stipulation, and after petitioner has filed an election to receive compensation pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-21(a)(1), the Secretary of Health and Human Services will issue the following vaccine compensation payments:

- A. A lump sum of **\$95,000.00** in the form of a check payable to petitioner. This amount represents compensation for all damages that would be available under 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-15(a).
- B. A lump sum of **\$485.22**,<sup>1</sup> representing reimbursement of a Medicaid lien for services rendered to petitioner by the State of New York, in the form of a check payable jointly to petitioner and the New York State Treasurer:

New York State Department of Health  
P. O. Box 415874  
Boston, MA 02241-5874  
Case ID: 198658

Petitioner agrees to endorse this check to the New York State Treasurer.

These amounts represent compensation for all damages that would be available under 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-15(a).

9. As soon as practicable after the entry of judgment on entitlement in this case, and after petitioner has filed both a proper and timely election to receive compensation pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-21(a)(1), and an application, the parties will submit to further proceedings

---

<sup>1</sup> This amount represents full satisfaction of any right of subrogation, assignment, claim, lien, or cause of action that the State of New York may have against any individual as a result of any Medicaid payments that the State of New York has made to or on behalf of Donna Smith as a result of her alleged vaccine-related injury suffered on or about October 16, 2019, under Title XIX of the Social Security Act, *see* 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-15(g), (h).

before the special master to award reasonable attorneys' fees and costs incurred in proceeding upon this petition.

10. Petitioner and her attorney represent that they have identified to respondent all known sources of payment for items or services for which the Program is not primarily liable under 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-15(g), including State compensation programs, insurance policies, Federal or State health benefits programs (other than Title XIX of the Social Security Act (42 U.S.C. § 1396 et seq.)), or entities that provide health services on a prepaid basis.

11. Payments made pursuant to paragraph 8 of this Stipulation and any amounts awarded pursuant to paragraph 9 will be made in accordance with 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-15(i), subject to the availability of sufficient statutory funds.

12. The parties and their attorneys further agree and stipulate that, except for any award for attorneys' fees and litigation costs, and past unreimbursed expenses, the money provided pursuant to this Stipulation will be used solely for the benefit of petitioner as contemplated by a strict construction of 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-15(a) and (d), and subject to the conditions of 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-15(g) and (h).

13. In return for the payments described in paragraphs 8 and 9, petitioner, in her individual capacity, and on behalf of her heirs, executors, administrators, successors, and assigns, does forever irrevocably and unconditionally release, acquit, and discharge the United States and the Secretary of Health and Human Services from any and all actions or causes of action (including agreements, judgments, claims, damages, loss of services, expenses and all demands of whatever kind or nature) that have been brought, could have been brought, or could be timely brought in the United States Court of Federal Claims, under the National Vaccine Injury Compensation Program, 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-10 et seq., on account of, or in any way growing out



of, any and all known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected personal injuries to or death of petitioner resulting from, or alleged to have resulted from, the flu vaccination administered on or about November 26, 2019, as alleged by petitioner in a petition for vaccine compensation filed on or about December 7, 2020, in the United States Court of Federal Claims as petition No. 20-1785V.

14. If petitioner should die prior to entry of judgment, this agreement shall be voidable upon proper notice to the Court on behalf of either or both of the parties.

15. If the special master fails to issue a decision in complete conformity with the terms of this Stipulation or if the United States Court of Federal Claims fails to enter judgment in conformity with a decision that is in complete conformity with the terms of this Stipulation, then the parties' settlement and this Stipulation shall be voidable at the sole discretion of either party.

16. This Stipulation expresses a full and complete negotiated settlement of liability and damages claimed under the National Childhood Vaccine Injury Act of 1986, as amended, except as otherwise noted in paragraph 9 above. There is absolutely no agreement on the part of the parties hereto to make any payment or do any act or thing other than is herein expressly stated and clearly agreed to. The parties further agree and understand that the award described in this Stipulation may reflect a compromise of the parties' respective positions as to liability and/or amount of damages, and further, that a change in the nature of the injury or condition or in the items of compensation sought, is not grounds to modify or revise this agreement.

17. This Stipulation shall not be construed as an admission by the United States or the Secretary of Health and Human Services that the flu vaccine caused petitioner's left shoulder injury, any other injury, or her current condition.

18. All rights and obligations of petitioner hereunder shall apply equally to petitioner's heirs, executors, administrators, successors, and/or assigns.

**END OF STIPULATION**

Respectfully submitted,

**PETITIONER:**

  
DONNA SMITH

**ATTORNEY OF RECORD FOR  
PETITIONER:**

Ronald Homer by Nathaniel  
RONALD C. HOMER      Rule 63.1(c)(2)  
Conway Homer, P.C.  
16 Shawmut Street  
Boston, MA 02116  
Tel: (617) 695-1990  
Email: pkelly@ccandh.com

**AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE  
OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL:**

Heather L. Pearlmán  
HEATHER L. PEARLMAN  
Deputy Director  
Torts Branch  
Civil Division  
U.S. Department of Justice  
P.O. Box 146  
Benjamin Franklin Station  
Washington, DC 20044-0146

**AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE  
OF THE SECRETARY OF HEALTH  
AND HUMAN SERVICES:**

George R.      Digitally signed by  
Grimes -S14      George R. Grimes -S14  
Date: 2023.07.18  
16:32:50 -04'00'  
CDR GEORGE REED GRIMES, MD, MPH  
Director, Division of Injury  
Compensation Programs  
Health Systems Bureau  
Health Resources and Services  
Administration  
U.S. Department of Health  
and Human Services  
5600 Fishers Lane, 08N146B  
Rockville, MD 20857

**ATTORNEY OF RECORD FOR  
RESPONDENT:**

Austin J. Egan  
AUSTIN J. EGAN  
Trial Attorney  
Torts Branch, Civil Division  
U.S. Department of Justice  
P.O. Box 146  
Ben Franklin Station  
Washington, DC 20044-0146  
Tel: (202) 451-7479  
Email: Austin.J.Egan@usdoj.gov

Dated: August 8, 2023